

Smart. Focused. Done Right.®



How Renewables and Distributed Resources Have Impacted Transmission in Germany

Chris Vlahoplus Partner and Clean Tech & Sustainability Practice Lead

September 30, 2014

Copy right © 2023 by ScottMadden, Inc. All rights reserved.

Fact-Finding Mission to Germany

- SEPA and ScottMadden sponsored the fact-finding mission
- Thirty U.S. executives attended, representing IOUs, public power, vertically integrated, PSC, solar industry, EEI, and EPRI
- Three days were spent in Dusseldorf meeting with German energy participants, such as policymakers, utilities, and others
- Share with you today
 - Overall Context
 - Issues and Impacts
 - Summary Observations



Germany – What You Need to Know

- Liberalization
- Shutdown of Nuclear
- High gas prices
- Increase in renewables
- Not an island
 - EU policies
 - Connections with neighboring countries
 - Carbon trading

Several Changes at Once



2

The German Energy Transition

Achieved 2020 2025 2013 2030 2035 2040 2050 -40 % greenhouse gas -23.8% -55 Climate reduction (vs. 1990) (estimated) -70 -80 to -95 % electricity 80 25.4% 65 55 to 60 50 consumption 40 to 45 35 Renewable **Energies** % final energy 12.4% 60 18 45 consumption (2012)30 -20 % primary energy -3,3 % consumption (vs. 2008) -50 Energy Efficiency +1.1% p.a. energy productivity +2.1% p.a. building renovation ~1% p.a. doubling of renovation rate: $1\% \rightarrow 2\%$

Energiewende Targets until 2050

Source: "Costs and Benefits of the Energy Transition" Dr. Martin Schöpe, Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Energy



German Electric Market Structure "Liberalization"

- Generators
 - Utility scale
 - Individuals
- Retailers
- More than 800 Distribution System Operators
 - IOUs and municipals
 - 20-year franchise
- Four Transmission System Operators (TSOs)
 - Plan the transmission system
 - Manage the supply market
 - Energy-only market





Nuclear Shutdowns

All nuclear to be shut down by 2022

Incumbents made the bet on gas—invested heavily





Renewable Energy Capacity Additions

Annual Renewable Energy Capacity Additions in Germany, 1990–2012



പ്പം scottmadden

Current Capacity and Generation

year 2014 GW 37.448 GW 40 34.638 GW 28.115 GW 28.403 GW 30 21.206 GW 20 12.068 GW 7.537 GW 10 5.607 GW Uranium Brown Coal Hard Coal Gas Wind Solar Biomass Hydro power

Net Installed Capacity Rating as of July 16, 2014

YTD Electricity Production through July 2014





Source: Fraunhofer Institute for Solar Energy Systems

7

Utility-Scale Wind in the North, Distributed Solar in the South





Source: SEPA Executive Fact-Finding Mission – September 17, 2014 – Netze BW GmbH, Gerhard Walker

8

Significant Variation in Load and Supply

- Industrial south net user
- Utility-scale wind in the north with constrained transmission
 - Loop flows through Poland
- Intermittency means significant reliance on neighbors
- Imports of French nuclear and Czech coal
- "Dumping" excess output

Electricity account balance 2013 [MW]



Source: "Energiew ende and Grid Development in Germany" Ulrike Hansen, International Affairs Energy, BNetzA



Significant Capital Investment Needed

- Long-range plans submitted jointly by the four TSOs
- Approval by the federal regulator
- Recovery through kWhr charge
- Investment through 2030

SCO



Source: German Energy Agency (Dena), 2012: Distribution Grid Study



It's Working with More Active Management of the Grid

Grid Interventions to Stabilize the Grid by Grid Operator TennetT 2003–2012





Summary

Significant Destruction of Value for Incumbents

RWE earnings are down significantly



Operating result in € bn



Summary

- To understand Germany, one must understand more than renewables
- Have moved to a model much like ERCOT but with TSO ownership of assets
- Reliability has been maintained without significant investment but with active management and reliance on neighboring systems
- But significant investments are on the horizon at both distribution and transmission levels
- Short-term results are questionable (increased CO2 and higher rates) but the focus is on the long game

